The Mill, by local artist Worthington Whittredge, is an example of the Dusseldorf-style landscapes which were the "collector's choice" in Cincinnati. This is one of the sixty-three oil paintings which Reuben Springer bequeathed to the Cincinnati Art Museum, which he had helped to organize.
Visitors to Cincinnati in mid-May 1886 must have nodded in approval of the cultural avenues open to them. There was the seventh May Music Festival which attracted thousands, while on May 17 the new Art Museum in Eden Park was dedicated with appropriate ceremonies. Tourists might also view the private art collections of George K. Shoenberger and Obed J. Wilson in Clifton and those of Nicholas Longworth II, L. B. Harrison, and William S. Groesbeck in East Walnut Hills. In such a variety of ways Cincinnatians focused attention on the cultural advances of their city in music and fine arts.

Although the immediate post-Civil War period was relatively quiet as far as the creative arts were concerned, a burgeoning interest in viewing and buying pictures attracted a number of influential and affluent Cincinnatians. The first attempt to unite artists and collectors came as early as 1866 when members of the city's art colony organized the short-lived Associated Artists of Cincinnati, with Charles T. Webber (1825-1911) as president, to display their canvases for sale. In 1868 a new association was formed called the Cincinnati Academy of Fine Arts, composed of civic leaders interested in promoting the sale of paintings in the city. Joseph Longworth, Henry Probasco, and William S. Groesbeck were among its members. This academy mounted two exhibitions of paintings by American artists at Wiswell's Gallery, 70 West Fourth Street.

It was during Cincinnati's third Industrial Exposition, however, that Cincinnatians had their first opportunity to view more extensive displays of art. Between 1870 and 1888 fourteen of these major expositions were held, serving as a showcase for products manufactured throughout the country and distributed extensively in the West and the South. The expositions were housed originally in the old Saengerfest building, which stood on the site of Music Hall. After that building was razed in 1876, the exhibitions were held in the north and south wings of Music Hall. In time, even this complex of buildings became inadequate, and adjacent temporary structures were erected for the later expositions. Several of these events brought in as many as 400,000 paid admissions, and over 1,200,000 people attended the last exposition in 1888 marking Cincinnati's centennial.

The first two expositions passed with little of the fine arts on display. Cer-
tainly the art exhibits were not comparable to those of industrial and commercial products. Private picture collectors were reluctant to lend pictures to be displayed in a hall which was not fireproof—and the old Saengerfest Hall was not. These deficiencies were overcome in the Industrial Exposition of 1872 when a dramatic new turn was given to the fine arts display and a fireproof structure built to house it. In that year an energetic committee was created to insure the presentation of a worthy fine arts exhibit. Its members—George Sharples, cotton and provision broker and amateur artist; P. H. Burt, banker and son of an early collector of paintings; and John R. Tait (1834-1909), artist, poet, and critic—had the enthusiastic support of the director of the expositions, Alfred T. Goshorn, who was later to become the first director of the Cincinnati Art Museum.

John R. Tait appears to have been the dynamic force in putting together this 1872 exhibit. The son of a well-to-do commission merchant in the city, Tait had studied art in Cincinnati under William L. Sonntag (1822-1900), and in European cities, particularly Dusseldorf, Germany. While in that city he had been commissioned to send approximately one hundred pictures to the New York Sanitary Fair of 1864 for exhibit and sale. This project gave him valuable experience and important contacts in Germany. On returning to Cincinnati in 1872, Tait designed and personally supervised the construction of a fireproof Art Hall in Washington Park, opposite Saengerfest Hall and the other exposition buildings.3

The Fine Arts Exhibit at the Industrial Exposition of 1872 has the distinction of being the first loan collection of paintings assembled in this country. The catalogue lists 298 oil paintings, 215 engravings, and 100 watercolors and drawings. The important collectors in Cincinnati, with but two exceptions, lent pictures and prints for viewing, while sixty-six artists, German and American, sent paintings for display and sale. So great was the interest in this exhibit that the Art Hall was kept open for two weeks after the other departments of the exposition had closed.4 The Fine Arts Department was now firmly established; thereafter, the art exhibit was an important feature of every exposition. That of 1880 is a good indication of local interest and progress in the fine arts. Its catalogue states that it was primarily a "Home Collection:"

_The paintings . . . are from the walls of our collectors, and from the studios of artists who are now, or who in the past have been, identified with Cincinnati . . . the Committee is confident that the public will find it . . . as a fair exponent of the culture and taste of our citizens and of the progress of art in our city._5

During the 1880's, the city's reputation was further enhanced by the organization of the Cincinnati Museum Association and the construction of its headquarters in Eden Park to house a permanent gallery of art. A visitor, writ-
The Century Illustrated Monthly Magazine for August, 1888, stated that “Cincinnati was the first of the Western cities to become known as a home for picture collectors, and it holds the first place at the present time in the amount of recent gifts to art.” Eight of these “picture collectors,” all civic leaders and men of financial means, owned collections regarded as significant by that generation of American critics. They were men whose fortunes had been made in pre-Civil War days, and their early acquisitions of pictures dated back to the war. Nearly all had originally resided in the basin of the city, but during the 1850’s and 1860’s most of them moved to the newly-developing suburbs where they constructed mansions, some of which were showplaces during and after the Gilded Age.

Of these private collectors, the Longworth family was the best known. Its acquisitions spanned several generations and served as a seedbed for several other treasuries of pictures. Most of the original Longworth collection found its way into the permanent collection of the Cincinnati Art Museum. All the Longworths shared a keen interest in art and had the necessary financial resources for making purchases on a continuing basis. The founder of the family fortune was Nicholas I, “Old Nick,” patron of a number of artists and art students. One is led to conclude that this wealthy eccentric was more interested in helping the artist than in an appreciation of the artist’s work. While no complete inventory of his collection has been located, there are frequent references to many good pictures in his home on Pike Street. These proved to be a source of inspiration to youthful art students. Nicholas died in 1863, leaving an estate concentrated in real estate, the value of which was estimated at from $12,000,000 to $15,000,000. The family leadership then passed to his son Joseph, who acquired most of the pictures for which the Longworth collection became famous.

A graduate of Yale University and the Cincinnati Law School, Joseph never practiced law but tended to his private interests, both philanthropic and artistic. In 1841 he married Annie Rives, the cultured daughter of Dr. Landon Rives. Joseph started his own collection of paintings in 1849 through orders given to his good friend, Worthington Whittredge (1820-1900), who was going abroad to study painting. With their three children, Joseph and Annie went to Europe in 1857 and stayed two years. Their extended European tour enabled the Longworths to browse leisurely through museums, studios, and salons. They became particularly interested in two painters of the Dusseldorf School—Charles F. Lessing and Andreas Achenbach—eventually acquiring the most extensive collection of their paintings in this country.

Joseph Longworth inherited his father’s idiosyncrasies in matters of dress; also like his father he studiously avoided political activity. There is considerable truth in his own statement that “he would never be known except as the son of his father and the father of his son.” It was Joseph who moved the
Joseph Longworth, above, moved from the Basin to the suburbs in 1848. He brought his family to a Grandin Road farm called “Rookwood,” opposite above, to which he added an art gallery, opposite below, in 1868 to house his ever-growing collection of German paintings.
Unlike other art collectors of the Gilded Age who sought the suburbs, Reuben R. Springer maintained a modest residence overlooking a small rhubarb patch at the northeast corner of Seventh and Plum Streets. The oil of Springer by Thomas S. Noble is in the Cincinnati Art Museum.
family to a Grandin Road farm where he erected a home called Rockwood, which included an art gallery and a studio in its tower for his wife. Here a circle of young artists and musicians often gathered for weekend parties. No local collector provided more dynamic civic leadership than Joseph Longworth. He was a president of the old Academy of Fine Arts, and the first president of the Cincinnati Museum Association, whose memorial to him extols Joseph as “the animating spirit” and “a constant visitor and a continual contributor.” It is known that he was in Europe in 1881 buying for the museum. He was generous in lending paintings for display at all of the city’s Industrial Expositions.

On Joseph’s death in 1883, his eldest son, Nicholas Longworth II, continued the family’s active interest in the Cincinnati Museum Association. Joseph’s other son, Dr. Landon Longworth, studied art in Karlsruhe, Germany, under the well-known artist Hans Gude, and was an accomplished violinist. While practicing medicine, Landon retained his interest in art and music until his early death at age thirty-one. Joseph’s only daughter, Maria Longworth Storer, also showed a keen affinity for art. Her efforts in founding the Rookwood Pottery are well known, and she was also instrumental in organizing Frank Duveneck’s first class in painting. Mrs. Larz Anderson I, a sister of Joseph, acquired a worthy private collection of pictures, as did his cousin, John Stettinius.

Although his fortune did not match that of the Longworths, nor was he blessed with immediate heirs to continue his artistic legacy, Reuben R. Springer was another noted picture collector of this era. One of the best-known benefactors of the city, Springer is primarily remembered as a patron of music, but his gifts to the Cincinnati Art Museum and Art Academy were equally generous. Springer made his fortune before the Civil War in the riverboat and commission business, and increased it through judicious investments in railroad stocks and real estate. A native of Kentucky, as a youth he came to Cincinnati where he married into the wealthy Kilgour family. During the 1840’s and 1850’s, he and his wife made frequent trips to Europe. The nucleus of his picture collection, which hung in his home at the corner of Seventh and Plum Streets, was gathered on these trips and through purchases from the Dusseldorf Gallery in New York City.

Springer’s taste in paintings, like that of the Longworths, was for canvases from the Dusseldorf School, but he was a patron of several local artists as well. The Springers were devout Roman Catholics, and Mrs. Springer gave St. Peter-in-Chains Cathedral a painting by Benjamin R. Haydon (English, 1786-1846) entitled Christ Entering Jerusalem. This was said to be the only picture by Haydon in America at that time, and it had created “a profound sensation” when it was first exhibited in London. At the Philadelphia Academy in 1845, it had been slightly damaged by fire and restored. Today Haydon’s
Lord of his manor on Lafayette Avenue was George K. Shoenberger. "Scarlet Oaks," an architectural amalgam of Romanesque and French Gothic, was a Clifton landmark during the Gilded Age and long after. It still stands today in elaborate elegance.
canvas hangs in the corridor of St. Gregory Seminary in the Cincinnati suburb of Mount Washington. One of the most important pictures in the Springer collection was *The Adoration of the Magi* by Edward Steinbruck (German, 1802-1882), a picture widely known in Europe before being brought to the states.²¹ Since the Springers had no close heirs, at his death in 1884 Reuben Springer willed his entire collection of sixty-three oil paintings and five pieces of statuary to the newly-established Art Museum. He also left a bequest of $40,000 to the Museum's endowment and an additional $20,000 to the Art Academy.²²

Not so well known as Springer and Longworth to later generations but an important figure in the social and business milieu of his day was George K. Shoenberger. Shoenberger migrated to Cincinnati from his native state of Pennsylvania in the 1830's as the representative of his father's iron manufacturing firm. The local branch prospered with the rapid pre-war growth of the West and the South. When Shoenberger completed his new home in Clifton in 1867, one of the highlights of his baronial mansion, Scarlet Oaks, was a gallery to display his art collection. A bluff and hearty personality, Shoenberger had a number of genre canvases as well as landscapes by German, Dutch, and American artists. For present-day art historians, his collection is noteworthy for a sequence of four allegorical scenes by Thomas Cole, the initiator of the native Hudson River School. This set of Cole's *Voyage of Life*, depicting *Childhood, Youth, Manhood*, and *Old Age*, was lost to the art world until the 1960's when the four paintings were rediscovered still hanging in the chapel of Scarlet Oaks, now the Bethesda Methodist Home for the Retired.²³ This series was highly praised by nineteenth-century Americans for "its inestimable moral qualities" and "for teaching a moral lesson...by elevating to a noble standard."²⁴

Like Joseph Longworth, Shoenberger was generous in lending his pictures to the art exhibits of the Industrial Expositions. After his death the collection appears to have been divided among his heirs. In addition to Cole's *Voyage of Life* several of the original collection still remain at Scarlet Oaks.²⁵ While all of the Springer collection and most of the Longworth collection found their way to the Cincinnati Art Museum, none of George Shoenberger's pictures apparently reached this permanent home.

Thomas Cole's works were also represented in the paintings collected by William W. Scarborough, who came to Cincinnati in 1846. He owned Cole's *Elijah Being Fed by the Ravens*, a picture widely reproduced at that time, and *View Across Frenchmen's Bay From Mt. Desert*, now considered one of Cole's better works. This scene of New England's rocky coast might have sparked nostalgic feelings in Scarborough, for he came from an eastern seafaring family. As a youth he had shipped as supercargo to the Orient and the Caribbean, then spent several years as a trader in Mazatlan, Mexico. Tiring of foreign
William S. Groesbeck's 38-room mansion, "Elmhurst," occupied a thickly-wooded knoll on 2.5 acres in East Walnut Hills. The blue limestone villa, which was home for members of the Groesbeck family from 1870 until 1940, had a picture gallery on the second floor.
wanderings, he then settled in Zanesville, Ohio, where from 1843 to 1846 he was a banker. Scarborough then moved to Cincinnati where he engaged, quite successfully, in various business enterprises. Most of his earnings were reinvested in real estate, and it was said that he “purchased property by the acre, which later was measured in feet.” At the time of his death in 1896, a local newspaper noted that “there were few of the large corporations of the Queen City . . . with which Mr. William Woolsey Scarborough was not at some time identified, either as director or chief executive officer.”

Scarborough was generous with his wealth. Part of the traveling money which the young artist Worthington Whittredge took from Cincinnati when he left for Europe in 1849 was a gift from Scarborough. Although he had not been a patron, Scarborough did offer Whittredge a letter of credit for $1,000. Scarborough seems also to have served as a broker for pictures sent by Whittredge from Europe. For the next few years it was to Scarborough that the young artist sent paintings for sale to Cincinnatians, and as Whittredge later wrote, “we kept an open account.” A few pictures from the Scarborough collection, including Cole’s View Across Frenchmen’s Bay From Mt. Desert, were given to the Cincinnati Art Museum in 1925 by his daughters Rebecca and Alice.

Near the Scarborough home in East Walnut Hills was Elmhurst, the stately residence of William S. Groesbeck, which housed another noteworthy collection of pictures. A lawyer, politician, and international authority on bimetallism, Groesbeck appears to have been primarily a scholar rather than an art collector. He inherited a considerable fortune from his father, who was a wholesale meat packer and banker before the Civil War. Groesbeck married Elizabeth Burnet, daughter of the prominent Judge Jacob Burnet, and like Scarborough and Longworth reinvested his fortune in real estate. He was a leader in civic art circles, serving as the first president of the Cincinnati Academy of Fine Arts, as well as a patron of local artists, with works by John R. Tait and Thomas Buchanan Read (1822-1872) as part of his collection. A number of Dusseldorf painters also were represented in his collection. Groesbeck’s son John visited Worthington Whittredge in Dusseldorf and was pressed into service as the model for a figure in Emanuel Leutze’s famous historical painting, Washington Crossing the Delaware. Canvases from the Groesbeck collection were frequently lent to the art displays at the various Industrial Expositions. The collection, however, was dispersed after the owner’s death in 1897.

Another leader in civic art functions and a collector in his own right was Learner B. Harrison. Born in Cincinnati in 1815, he entered a grocery firm as clerk but soon established a prosperous wholesale grocery house with William Hopper as his partner. Both men were able to retire from their business in 1860 with large fortunes. After the Civil War both entered the banking trade and earned a second fortune in banking and investments in real estate and
The mansion of the L. B. Harrisons off Grandin Road commanded a sweeping view up and down the Ohio River. "Weebetook," a two-story, blue limestone structure, was lived in by the Harrison family from 1864 until 1940, when it was razed in order to subdivide the 63-acre estate. (The oils of Mr. and Mrs. L. B. Harrison by Joseph Oriel Eaton are in the collection of Mrs. Tylor Field.)
railroad stocks. When Harrison died in 1902 at the age of eighty-seven, his fortune was estimated at $5,000,000.33 Taciturn, unostentatious, and undemonstrative, Harrison is now probably known only as the benefactor of the club that bears his name. Yet he was an effective community leader in fine arts, a trustee of the Cincinnati Museum Association for twelve years and a generous donor to the museum. He was also a patron of Joseph Oriel Eaton (1829-1875), a resident artist in Cincinnati in the 1860's who painted several fine portraits of Harrison's family.34

The pictures which Harrison bought included a number by European painters, procured by his close friend, the Reverend Moncure D. Conway, former pastor of the First Congregational Church in Cincinnati. At the auction of the famous Joseph Gillott Collection held at Christie's in London in 1872, Conway secured for Harrison J.M.W. Turner's *Mist on the Thames*, which now hangs in the Cincinnati Art Museum. He also obtained for him several works by French artists: Jean P. Millet's *The Shepherdess* and Theodore Rousseau's *Rocks in the Forest of Fontainebleau.*35

A preference for French painters was demonstrated in the collection of another Cincinnatian, George W. Hoadly, a half-brother of Scarborough. Like him, Hoadly came from New England to the West as a youth, but chose to enter the legal profession. The Cincinnati law firm of Hoadly, Jackson, and Colston became eminently successful in the practice of corporation law. Hoadly's interest in art was more than that of a desultory collector. He too used the services of Moncure Conway to buy for him in Europe, though Hoadly himself made several visits there.36 In 1878 his collection comprised thirty canvases, including some by Jean Corot (French, 1796-1875), Gustave Courbet (French, 1819-1877), Hugues Merle (French, 1823-1881), and Charles F. Daubigny (French, 1817-1878), as well as works by Flemish and German painters.37 Hoadly was as generous as Longworth in lending pictures to the Art Museum, which he helped to organize. After a single term as governor of Ohio from 1884 to 1886, Hoadly practiced law in New York, where he died in 1902. A few of his paintings were eventually given to the Cincinnati Art Museum, though his gifts to the museum consist primarily of a large number of drawings from J.M.W. Turner's "Liber Studiorum."38

Canvases from French painters were found in much greater abundance in the collection of Henry Probasco, probably one of the most distinguished collections in the Midwest at that time. Since the entire collection was sold at auction in New York in 1887, a complete inventory exists of his holdings.39 Probasco had come to Cincinnati in 1835 and found employment in the hardware firm of his brother-in-law Tyler Davidson, and soon became a partner. By 1856 the firm was the largest of its kind in the city and ten years later Probasco was able to retire from the business with a considerable fortune. By this
time he had completed the construction of Oakwood, his new mansion in Clifton. He had become an inveterate collector, not only of pictures but also of statuary, bronzes, and objects d’art; his library of incunabula, collections of Audubon’s *Birds of America* and *Quadrupeds* were so prized that, through the agency of former Cincinnatian William Frederick Poole, they were bought in 1899 by the Newberry Library in Chicago and form the nucleus of that important collection. His interest in paintings and statuary led Probasco to plan an Art Hall in Clifton to permanently house his collections for the benefit of the general public, but before the idea matured the Panic of 1873 and subsequent depression proved disastrous for Probasco’s investments. Generous to a fault, and overly optimistic, this dynamic civic leader, donor of the Tyler Davidson Fountain, never succeeded in recouping his personal fortune. When he died in 1902 his fortune was gone.

In 1867, on one of his frequent European trips, Probasco had bought four marble busts of Roman Emperors, which had been in the palace of Cardinal Tosti in Rome. After Probasco’s death, when his collection of statuary was sold at auction in New York, these were bought by Alexander McDonald and L. B. Harrison of Cincinnati who gave them to the Art Museum. As far as can be ascertained, these are the only items of Probasco’s extensive acquisitions that found their way into the city’s permanent collections. Murat Halstead, prominent editor of the Cincinnati *Commercial Gazette*, was in New York at the time of the sale of Probasco’s paintings in 1887. His report of the auction gives some indication of the prices paid for pictures in the 1880’s. He calculated that the total sale brought around $168,700. The highest price, $21,000, was paid for Theodore Rousseau’s *Summer Landscape*, and the bidding was followed by applause. The most spirited bidding, Halstead reported, was for Jean Millet’s *Peasants Bringing Home a Calf*, which brought $18,000. Another painting, Jules Breton’s *The Colza Gatherers*, was applauded at the unveiling, and it went for $16,600. Halstead was disappointed when his favorite picture in the collection, William von Kaulbach’s *Mother Love*, widely reproduced in engravings and lithographs, sold for only $3,450. “The New Yorkers,” commented Halstead, “seem to have curious notions about art, the current objection to Kaulbach’s great work being that the woman was too muscular and the picture too large to hang conveniently.”

It is probable that the Henry Probasco collection was the best in Cincinnati. It represented the taste of a collector who had become familiar with a wide spectrum of nineteenth-century European art and whose taste came to be the prevailing one in local art circles.

Two other Cincinnati collections of this period should be mentioned briefly. That of Matthew Addy, founder and president of the Addyston Pipe and Steel Company, hung in his Mount Auburn home, but it could not be compared with that of Probasco. The Addy collection was sold at auction in New York in
Henry Probasco's "Oakwood" on Lafayette Avenue was considered Anglo-Norman in style when completed in 1866. It provided ample space for his extensive library which included incunabula, Bibles, and illuminated manuscripts, as well as his paintings and prints. The 30-acre estate was a botanical showplace featuring landscaped gardens and a conservatory with 4,000 rosebushes.
William Karrmann, an immigrant from Germany, assembled what was then said to be the finest collection of etchings west of the Alleghenies. He was a pharmacist, and though his financial means were limited, his collection of prints was of sufficient merit to evoke praise from many contemporary critics.

References have been made to the large number of paintings in Cincinnati collections by artists of the Dusseldorf School. Indeed, not a single collection mentioned was without representation from that school, which was at its peak during the 1830 to 1860 period, just at the time when these Cincinnati collectors began to assemble their collections. There was a Dusseldorf Gallery in New York City during the 1850's, and auction sales of paintings from that gallery were held in December 1862 and December 1863. Two young Cincinnati artists, Worthington Whittredge and John R. Tait, went on to further training in Dusseldorf, but continued to exert influence as tastemakers back home. Another Ohioan, Alexander H. Wyant (1836-1892), whose patron was Nicholas Longworth I, as well as Langdon Longworth studied with Hans Gude who in turn had been a student at the Dusseldorf Academy. Tait's initiative in staging Cincinnati's first public loan exhibition at the Industrial Exposition of 1872 has already been pointed out; at that exhibit the Dusseldorf firm of Bismeyer and Kraus offered a number of pictures for display and sale.

Charles F. Lessing (1808-1880) is generally regarded as the most virile representative of the Dusseldorf School, particularly in historical genre. His works were in great favor and they commanded the highest prices. The Longworth collection had the largest number in this country: at least eight oils as well as more than five hundred of Lessing's drawings. The Anderson, Scarborough, Hoadly, and Springer collections also included some of Lessing's paintings. More numerous than the Lessings were the canvases of Andreas Achenbach (1815-1910), generally regarded as the best of the landscape painters of the Dusseldorf School, and a close associate of Whittredge. In 1868 at least thirty of Achenbach's pictures were to be found in Cincinnati collections. A third artist widely represented in Cincinnati was Hans Gude (Norwegian, 1825-1903), possibly because his pupils Alexander Wyant and Langdon Longworth helped to popularize his canvases at home. Other European artists whose works appeared in most of these collections were B. C. Koek-Koek (Dutch, 1803-1862) and E. J. Verboeckhoven (Belgian, 1793-1881). Verboeckhoven was essentially a portrayer of animals and his pictures of sheep, cattle, and horses were popular with Americans, none of whom were yet far removed from rural surroundings.

American artists, however, were not overlooked in the assembling of these Cincinnati collections. Worthington Whittredge was the most popular due to his ties of friendship, mainly with the gentry, in the city. Born and reared on a farm near Springfield, Ohio, he came to Cincinnati as a young man to begin
Half-brothers William W. Scarborough, right, and George W. Hoadly, above, were avid art collectors. This painting of the rocky Atlantic shore by Thomas Cole, once part of the Scarborough collection, is now in the Cincinnati Art Museum.
his studies in painting. During his ten years abroad, nearly all of his works were sent back to Cincinnati so that until 1859 his reputation was primarily local. He later became president of the National Academy of Design.\(^53\)

A few generalizations regarding the subjects of the canvases in these Queen City collections of the Gilded Age can be made. Landscapes constituted by far the greatest number. It has been said that Victorians "liked pictures with a story and, if possible, a moral, and a good dose of sentiment."\(^54\) This accounted for the presence of allegorical and genre paintings. All the collections included paintings of some historical event, usually very large in size. The Probasco collection, for example, had four such works and the Longworth collection had two of Lessing's canvases depicting events in the life of John Huss, a leader of the Protestant Reformation. Portraits appeared in every collection, the Springer collection including the well-known porthole portrait of George Washington by Rembrandt Peale. The two painters living in Cincinnati who appear to have been most patronized by Cincinnati collectors were Thomas S. Noble (1835-1907) and Joseph O. Eaton (1829-1875).\(^55\)

These art collectors of the Gilded Age were not the earliest "picture collectors" in Cincinnati, but they were the first to assemble paintings of sufficient worth and number to be recognized as true collectors. By the end of the nineteenth century the legacy of art collecting had passed to a newer generation with more modern tastes and wider opportunities for purchase. Miss Mary Hanna, Mr. and Mrs. Charles Phelps Taft I, and John J. Emery were among the most significant of these, and they assembled collections which now are among the finest cultural treasures of the Queen City.

**JOSEPH E. HOLLIDAY** is Professor Emeritus of History and Associate Dean Emeritus, College of Arts and Sciences, at the University of Cincinnati. Since his retirement from the university, Dean Holliday has joined the staff of The Cincinnati Historical Society as a volunteer.

(1) Cincinnati Commercial Gazette, May 18, 1886.
(5) Catalogue of the Art Department of the Eighth Cincinnati Industrial Exposition, 1880, preface.


Commercial Gazette, Dec. 31, 1883.

Commercial, May 20, 1868; Nichols, "Private Picture Collectors in Cincinnati," 520. There is a biographical sketch of Shoenberger in The Biographical Cyclopaedia of Ohio of the Nineteen Century (Cincinnati, 1876), 599.

Clara Longworth de Chambrun, The Making of Nicholas Longworth (N.Y., 1933), 117.


The story of this rediscovery has been written by Edward H. Dwight and Richard J. Boyle, "Rediscovery: Thomas Cole's 'Voyage of Life',' Art in America, vol. 55 (May, 1967), 60-63. This set appears to have been purchased by Shoenberger some time between 1848 and 1855. It was painted in Rome, and differs in details from Cole's first set by that name, which is now in the Munson-Williams-Proctor Institute, Utica, New York.

Commercial, May 20, 1868; Nichols, "Private Picture Collectors in Cincinnati," 520. There is a biographical sketch of Shoenberger in The Biographical Cyclopaedia of Ohio of the Nineteen Century (Cincinnati, 1876), 599.


(32) Strahan, Art Treasures of America, II, 80; Nichols, "Private Picture Collectors in Cincinnati," 519; Third Cincinnati Industrial Exposition, 1872, Art Department catalog.

(33) Theodore Greve, Centennial History of Cincinnati, II, 33-35; Enquirer, July 2, 3, 4, 1902, has an obituary and stories regarding L. B. Harrison.

(34) Exhibition of Paintings by Joseph Oriel Eaton and Sculptures by Hiram Powers, March 12 through April 18, 1934, Cincinnati Art Museum catalog.

(35) Conway, a prominent Unitarian minister and author, had been pastor of the First Congregational Church in Cincinnati from 1856 to 1862. While in Cincinnati he married Ellen Davis Dana, and they continued to maintain close ties with Cincinnatians. They moved to London where for twenty years Conway was pastor of the South Place Chapel. The Conways were inveterate travelers and made frequent trips to the Continent. See W. B. Cairns, "Moncure D. Conway," Dictionary of American Biography, IV, 364-365. Strahan, Art Treasures of America, II, 80.

(36) Homer C. Hockett, "George Hoadly," Dictionary of American Biography, IX, 84-85. The Commercial, Aug. 13, 1881, noted that Hoadly was then in Europe buying some "art treasures."

(37) Strahan, Art Treasures of America, II, 79-80; Third Cincinnati Industrial Exposition, 1872, Art Department catalog; Eighth Cincinnati Industrial Exposition, 1880, Art Department catalog; Commercial Gazette, April 17, 1887.


(39) Catalogue of High-Class Paintings . . . in the Private Collection of Mr. Henry Probasco, Cincinnati, Ohio, to be sold . . . at Chickering Hall, American Art Associates, 1887. Probasco privately printed, in 1873, a catalog of all his collections. A copy owned by Robert Clarke, Cincinnati book dealer, is now in The Cincinnati Historical Society. It was Clarke who arranged for the sale of Probasco's rare books to the Newberry Library trustees, and in Clarke's copy of the book the sale price is noted for each item.

(40) Catalogue of Collection of Marble Statuary, Ceramics, and Furniture of Mr. Henry Probasco, Cincinnati, Ohio, to be sold on January 26 and 27, 1899, Fifth Avenue Art Galleries, New York.

(41) William L. Williamson, William Frederick Poole and the Modern Library Movement (Columbia University Press, 1963), 146-147. Poole had served as librarian of the Cincinnati Public Library from 1870 to 1873 before moving to Chicago. Probasco was an energetic member of the Cincinnati Library Board, which had built a new building in 1870.

(42) Gazette, June 4, 20, 1873; Church's Musical Visitor, II, No. 10 (July, 1873), 6.


(45) Commercial Gazette, April 19, 1887.


(47) Times-Star, Jan. 6, 1893.

(48) Strahan, Art Treasures of America, II, 80; Nichols, "Private Picture Collectors in Cincinnati," 520; Third Cincinnati Industrial Exposition, 1872, Art Department catalog; Commercial, June 21, 1874. For an obituary of Karrmann, see Biographical


(51) *Commercial*, May 20, 1868.


(55) *King’s Pocket Book of Cincinnati* (Cambridge, Mass., 1879), 76; *Commercial Gazette*, May 9, 1891.